

BALI MINISTERIAL PROCESS

Inaugural People Smuggling Regional Targeting Workshop

Meeting Minutes

24 -25 May 2004

I. Workshop opening

Irena Vojackova-Sollorano, Regional Representative of Southeast Asia, The International Organisation for Migration (IOM), Regional Office Bangkok opened the inaugural meeting of the **People Smuggling Regional targeting Workshop** at **9.00 am** on **24 May 2004** in **Bangkok, Thailand**. This was followed by the key note address by **Police Lieutenant General Chanvut Vajrabukka, Commissioner, Royal Thai Police, Immigration Bureau**.

II. Call to order

Police Major General Krerkphong Pukprayura, Coordinator, Ad Hoc Expert Working Group 2 called the work shop to order at **9.30 am**. This was followed by a work shop overview by Federal Agent Bruce Hill, Coordinator People Smuggling, Australian Federal Police.

III. Introductions

The following participants were present:

Country	Name	Organisation
Thailand	Police Major General Surapol Tanakoses	Royal Thai Police, Immigration Bureau
Sri Lanka	Assistant Superintendent Mr. D.R.L. RANAWEERA	Criminal Investigations Department Sri Lanka Police
Sri Lanka	Assistant Director Mr. C.N. WAKISHTA	Directorate of Internal Intelligence, Police Department
Singapore	Senior Officer (Field operations 2) Alex Chan Hwa Wee	Immigration & Checkpoints Authority (ICA) Field Ops Branch
Singapore	Deputy Superintendent Ong Kak Wee	ICA Intelligence Operations Branch
Project Bridge	Elke Schmidt (guest attendee)	Project Bridge Interpol – Crime Intelligence Officer
Philippines	Chief Inspector Cosme A Abrenica	Philippine Centre on Transnational Crime
Philippines	Senior Inspector Marlowe Q Torina	Philippine Centre on Transnational Crime
Pakistan	Deputy Director Raja Manzoor ELLAHI	Federal Investigation Agency
New Zealand	Susan Egan	NZ Immigration Service
New Zealand	Andrew Holmes	NZ Immigration Service
New Zealand	Mike Bush	NZ Police Liaison Officer Bangkok
Malaysia	Deputy Superintendent BAHARUDDIN Bin AHMAD	Special Branch, Royal Malaysian Police
Malaysia	Assistant Superintendent AHMAD FAWZAN Bin MOHAMAD	Special Branch, Royal Malaysian Police

Macau SAR	Chief Superintendent Adriano Marques HO	Macau Judiciary Police
Macau SAR	Ms Priscilla VU Kuan-hei	Macau Judiciary Police
Japan	Superintendent Itsuo YAMAGUCHI	National Police Agency
Japan	Deputy Director Masashi YAMANO	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Indonesia	Police Colonel Deddy Fauzielhakin	Indonesian National Police, Indonesian Embassy, Bangkok
Hong Kong SAR	Detective Senior Inspector Brian LAM Chun-kit	Hong Kong Police Force
China	Section Chief WANG Ben	Border Control Department
China	Section Chief WANG Yang	Entry and Exit Administration Department
Australia	Federal Agent Brad Marden	Australian Federal Police, Team Leader People Smuggling
Australia	Federal Agent Scott Gilbert	Australian Federal Police, Police Advisor Royal Thai Police, Immigration Bureau, Immigration Transnational Crime

IV. Opening issues

Background

On 29-30 April 2003, the Foreign Ministers of Indonesia and Australia Co-Chaired the Second Bali Regional Ministerial Conference on People Smuggling, Trafficking in Persons and Related Transnational Crime (PSTPRTC). At the end of that meeting they released a joint statement which noted that all forms of transnational crime ruthlessly exploited border security and management systems, particularly those of countries that were in the process of developing national, regional and global capacities to combat PSTPRTC. The Ministers agreed that, subject to domestic laws and according to their respective national circumstances, they would work towards developing more effective information and intelligence sharing arrangements within the region, to obtain a more complete picture of smuggling and trafficking activities and other forms of illegal migration.

The Ministers welcomed the activities of the two Ad Hoc Experts' Groups established at the first Bali Regional Ministerial Conference. Ad Hoc Experts' Group I having been established to promote regional and international cooperation, while the mandate of Ad Hoc Experts' Group II was to assist States to strengthen policy making, legislative arrangements and law enforcement practices. The Ministers went on to recommend building on the momentum generated by the Bali Process by continuing the work of the two Ad Hoc Experts' Groups.

Since the Bali Ministerial Conference, Ad Hoc Experts' Group II has continued to meet and has developed a number of objectives and strategies to help combat PSTPRTC. One of these strategies is the formation of a taskforce to target known people smugglers and traffickers in persons. This workshop is the first step in developing that taskforce.

For the purpose of this workshop it is not intended to strictly define people smuggling versus trafficking and an interesting outcome would be the identification of cross overs between one countries trafficking target and another country's smuggling target.

Workshop Objective

To identify people smuggling or trafficking targets who are of a transnational nature and of interest to a significant number of the countries participating in the workshop. These people will then be the subjects of an ongoing targeting process with a view to regional disruption of people smuggling/trafficking. The manner of the ongoing targeting process will be determined at the workshop.

Expected Outcomes

The workshop will focus on the exchange of best practice and intelligence based on current investigations. It will investigate the exchange and processing of information on an international level. It should lead to an ongoing process for the targeting of transnational people smuggling/trafficking in the region.

The three target packages to be supplied by each country are expected to provide the basis for the development of a target list after feedback from the other participating countries. The final expected outcomes from this process are:

- Identifying regional organised crime groups involved in illegal immigration.
- Identifying the membership, hierarchies, modus operandi and criminal activities of those groups.
- Collation of this information for analysis and dissemination.
- Identifying links between ongoing investigations in other countries or providing previously unknown information in order to initiate investigations.

To achieve this there will need to be agreement by the participating countries to follow up on an amalgamated list of targets. This agreement should lead to a method for the information on the various targets nominated by the participating countries to be collated, cross referenced with other countries data holdings and re-disseminated to each country as a prioritised target list. An option is to use the facilities of the Royal Thai Police Immigration Transnational Crime Tactical Intelligence Centre to assist in this process.

Each country will also provide a brief people smuggling/trafficking overview including a summary of the modus operandi of people smugglers/traffickers in their country. This is expected to contribute to a better overall understanding of people smuggling/trafficking and the methods used by smugglers/traffickers within the region.

Finally the workshop participants will need to determine the nature of the ongoing targeting process based on the target list produced by this workshop and post workshop activities. The eventual aim being the joint investigation of people smuggling/trafficking targets of regional significance and the disruption/dismantling of their criminal networks.

V. Syndicate work – Presentations and Findings

1. Collection of data – Delegates: Australia (Facilitator), Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines & Sri Lanka
 - a. Each delegate unanimously agreed that people smuggling information/intelligence would be welcomed from partner countries.
 - b. The target profiles to include names, DOB, POB, telephone/mobile numbers, national identification numbers, passport details, location, photographs, associates, background information

- c. Target list to be summarized in a spreadsheet format with the original profiles attached.
 - d. The target list to be promulgated to the Partner countries and a response to the target list to be returned by partner countries within agreeable timelines.
Responses to the target list to consist of
 - i. a new target profile where the responding country has information on the main target and
 - ii. comment on other entities/nominals on the target profile (i.e. associates phone numbers and addresses)
 - e. The ITCTIC will prepare the final target list based on the value added targeting material including link charts.
 - f. The ITCTIC to prepare a strategic analysis and overview of the current people smuggling situations:
 - i. The strategic analysis is to relate to the target list, and
 - ii. focus on the factors why PII's are using particular countries passports.
2. Methods of Communication – China (Facilitator), New Zealand, Singapore & Thailand
- a. Require a quick and convenient process using Thailand as the channel to the partner countries possibly through
 - i. Liaison Officer Network
 - ii. Interpol – Project Bridge as the receptor of and transfer of information. Interpol can check their indices for any connections to the targets.
 - iii. Bali II Website (In the future his website will have the facility to have a password protected secure email system)
 - b. A suggestion for information/operational intelligence to be forwarded direct to the partner country involved in the investigation.
 - c. Set up an information Centre to transfer the information to partner countries.
 - d. China Delegation – China requires a formal referral to Senior management/Ministers for the exchange of information
 - e. Require a central repository centre for the information to be analyzed.
 - f. (Pakistan) The ITCTIC be the focus for information and analysis.
3. Ranking of Targets – Japan (Facilitator), Hong Kong SAR, Macau SAR, Pakistan
- a. The ranking of targets should be based on:
 - i. Solidity of the evidence
 - ii. Intensity of the crime
 - iii. Size of the international ring
 - b. (HK) Should have a target list, exchange information and commence operational connectivity now.

VI. Country Presentations

AUSTRALIA

CHINA

HONG KONG SAR

INDONESIA

JAPAN

MACAU SAR

MALAYSIA

INTERPOL - PROJECT BRIDGE

VII. Adjournment

Police Major General Krerckphong Pukprayura adjourned the meeting at **5.00 PM**

TUESDAY 25 May 2004

VIII. Call to order

Police Major General Krerckphong Pukprayura, Coordinator, Ad Hoc Expert Working Group 2 called the work shop to order at **8.30 am**. This was followed by a work shop review by Federal Agent Bruce Hill, Coordinator People Smuggling, Australian Federal Police.

IX. Country Presentations

NEW ZEALAND

PAKISTAN

UNITED STATES – Guest Speaker

X. Royal Thai Police ITCTIC

Visit to the Royal Thai Police Immigration Bureau, Immigration Transnational Crime Tactical Intelligence Centre (ITCTIC) , Bangkok, Thailand

Presentation by Police Advisor Scott Gilbert on the role and functions of the ITCTIC

Outcome of the ITCTIC visit:

It was agreed by the delegates that the ITCTIC would be a suitable place to house the targeting data provided from this workshop process.

XI. Country Presentations

PHILLIPINES

SINGAPORE

SRI LANKA

THAILAND

Outcome of the Country presentations:

An understanding of each country's' view on people smuggling/trafficking and the methods used by smugglers/traffickers in that country.

XII. Future Directions

1. Federal Agent Bruce Hill chaired discussion on the future directions for this process:
 - c. It was agreed that the final outcome of this workshop and post workshop activity will be a ranked spreadsheet of potential people smuggling targets, a series of link charts and a regional strategic overview of people smuggling.
 - d. It was agreed that the following timetable would apply to the compilation of the final target list:
 - i. Initial spreadsheet to be sent out to the participants by the end of June 2004.
 - ii. Where privacy laws, organisational policy and operational security permit, each member nation will return their value added target information by the end of July 2004.
 - iii. The final target list will be returned to the participants by the end of August 2004.
 - e. It was agreed that the delegates would take the minutes of this workshop back to their respective organizations and, where necessary seek advice/approval to participate in the above targeting process.
 - f. It was agreed that, after this targeting process is concluded, consideration would be given to holding further workshop(s) to progress multilateral investigations of the identified targets.
2. F/A Hill then provided the closing address.

XIII. Closure

The Chairperson, Police Major General Kreckphong Pukprayura formally closed the meeting at **5.30pm**.

XIV. OUTCOMES –

Collective overview from work shop delegates:

- Timely development of target list
- Meet regularly
- Provided timely feedback
- Keep a simple focus
- Keep the lines of communications open
- The work shop was beneficial for countries (Philippines)
- A good Initiative by AFP (Pakistan)
- We need good targets and we need to focus on the those targets
- Look for other People Smuggling Targets for consolidation of intelligence across all participants indices.
- Recommendation that all the information be compiled and analysed and feed back to the source countries
- Recommendation to establish a Secretariat within the ITCTIC.

Minutes submitted by: Federal Agent Brad Marden

Minutes approved by: Federal Agent Bruce Hill