

BALI PROCESS AD HOC GROUP

WORKSHOP ON BIOMETRICS FOR IDENTITY INTEGRITY IN IMMIGRATION
NEW DELHI, INDIA, 23-26 APRIL 2012

CO-CHAIRS' STATEMENT

1. The Bali Process on People Smuggling, Trafficking in Persons and Related Transnational Crime (Bali Process) Ad Hoc Group (AHG) Workshop on Biometrics for Identity Integrity in Immigration was held in New Delhi, India on 23-26 April 2012. The meeting was co-chaired by India and Australia and attended by representatives of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Australia, Peoples Republic of Bangladesh, India, Indonesia, Malaysia, Maldives, Republic of the Union of Myanmar, Islamic Republic of Pakistan, the Philippines, Sri Lanka, Kingdom of Thailand, United States of America, and Vietnam as well as representatives from the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). Canada and the United Kingdom attended the meeting as observers.
2. The theme of the meeting was 'Strategies for use of biometrics in immigration'.

Proceedings

3. The workshop was officially opened by Mr Lachlan Strahan, the Australian Acting High Commissioner to India. The meeting was co-chaired by Mr Amarendra Khatua, Additional Secretary, Indian Ministry of External Affairs and Mr Paul Cross, Assistant Secretary, Identity Branch, Australian Department of Immigration and Citizenship. Mr Strahan emphasised that biometrics offers significant opportunities firstly to protect against external and internal threats by improving identity verification for security and law enforcement purposes and secondly to facilitate improved services such as increasing the efficiency of processing passengers at airports to enable increased passenger volumes.
4. Co-chair Mr Paul Cross provided the members with an overview of biometric technology and its current application in border and immigration processes. Mr Cross highlighted the goals of the workshop including developing a stocktake of biometrics across Bali Process countries and a framework of principles for further cooperation with biometrics.
5. Co-chairs expressed appreciation to the International Organization for Migration and the Australian High Commission in New Delhi for their assistance with logistical arrangements.

Key Theme

6. Co-chairs emphasised the need for cooperation between countries in managing cross—border risks and suggested that a set of agreed strategies between Bali Process countries would improve immigration outcomes and maximise the benefits of biometrics for all partners.

Country Presentations

7. Members provided country presentations outlining the types of biometrics collected, the purpose of collection, and from whom biometrics are collected. All countries agreed that further adoption of biometric technology would deliver benefits related to improved security, service, and savings, and expressed an in-principle desire to share biometric information with partners where legislative and regulatory requirements permit and in a spirit of protecting privacy.
8. A number of common themes, opportunities and challenges were identified. These included ensuring biometric collection practices are robust and secure, safeguarding the security and accuracy of data; increasing public awareness of the broader benefits of biometrics; and promoting the value of investment in biometric programs.
9. The value of sourcing client biometric information directly from collection authorities with informed client consent was endorsed as a principle.
10. A table summarising key information from each country's presentations was collated to increase awareness among delegates about data sources and business processes including biometrics across countries.

Case Studies

11. Four case studies on experiences with biometrics in immigration were presented by India, Malaysia and Sri Lanka.
12. India presented two case studies: *Unique Identification Authority of India (UIDAI)*; and *Immigration Visa and Foreigner's Registration and Tracking (IVFRT)*. Delegates were impressed by the scale of India's undertaking to enrol more than 1 billion citizens with a unique identity number that is anchored by biometrics (facial image, fingerprints and iris scans).
13. Malaysia's presentation emphasised the significant benefits biometrics offer to facilitate smoother travel for citizens and foreign nationals entering and exiting Malaysia. Delegates were impressed with the multi-focussed approach adopted by Malaysia and its focus on benefits to clients, with many countries seeking further information on Malaysia's systems



Bali Process Ad Hoc Group
Workshop on Biometrics for Identity Integrity in Immigration
India 23-26 April 2012

and experiences.

14. Sri Lanka shared its particular challenges as an emerging user of biometrics with *Biometrics for Passport Development*. Sri Lanka is rapidly developing a biometric passport to be implemented in the next couple of years.

Break-out Group Discussions

15. Group One: What are the key privacy, ethical and legal challenges in biometrics to increase cooperation and data sharing? The group agreed that this question could be discussed in terms of the challenges for citizens and non-citizens and identified the following key challenges.

Citizens

- Religious and cultural barriers to certain biometrics
- Current legal parameters
- Absence of legal authority
- Reliance on voluntary subscription
- Trust – unknown future uses of biometric data
- Lack of awareness of benefit
- Theft, tampering of information
- Security, storage, encryption requirements
- Cases where biometrics are not available

Non-citizens

- No legal authority
- Trust: unknown use and sharing
- Lack of awareness

What are the next steps to resolve these challenges?

- Collect more than one accepted biometric (most common biometrics include face and fingerprints to maximise sharing)
- Laws to protect privacy
- Minimum standards
- Informed consent
- Greater public awareness campaigns about biometrics (through for example schools, airports, media, pamphlets, personal security etc) to increase levels of comfort, methods of collection, fairness and transparency and highlight themes such as
 - Security
 - Benefits for



Bali Process Ad Hoc Group
Workshop on Biometrics for Identity Integrity in Immigration
India 23-26 April 2012

- Employment facilitation
- Convenience in accessing agency services
- Faster travel
- Purpose - immigration with limited exceptions
- Consider implementation of developing voluntary international standards for biometrics such as the ICAO model

16. Break-out Group Two discussed the key technical challenges in biometrics to increase cooperation and data sharing. The group recognised that technical solutions addressing improved information sharing would be contingent on the policy and governance frameworks developed by individual countries. The group identified numerous technical challenges, however reached a consensus that three issues were priorities. These were:

- Common biometric modalities for collection
 - Internal
 - External
- High cost of large scale biometrics programs
- Integration with legacy systems (and/or replacement)
 - Technical complexity
 - Different domestic legacy systems across agency boundaries

The next steps to resolve these challenges include the following:

Different biometric modalities/collection gaps

- Documenting current and proposed systems and providing visibility into current usage
- Identifying standards applied in these systems
- Analysis of strengths/benefits of each system
- Identification of business case elements and cost benefit analysis
- Sharing lessons learnt from other member states
- Decisions regarding the best system for your country (including best options for data sharing with other countries)

High cost of implementing biometrics in a tight fiscal environment

- Develop a comprehensive business case which identifies clear benefits including:
 - Savings
 - Efficiencies – client service
 - Security
 - Savings deployed to higher value work
 - External collaboration opportunities

Continue with legacy systems or new systems?



Bali Process Ad Hoc Group
Workshop on Biometrics for Identity Integrity in Immigration
India 23-26 April 2012

- Conduct business process analysis
 - Analysis and documentation of options including lessons learnt from partners
 - Evaluation of options

- 17. Have regard for UNHCR principles related to the handling of personal data of refugees and asylum seekers, in particular the need to ensure personal data is never supplied to the countries that refugees and asylum seekers seek protection from. Another priority is to ensure that new information regarding refugee claims is considered when assessing repeat claims to protection. A statement from UNHCR is attached.

Recommendations

1. The break out groups discussed the two major themes that had emerged during Day One of the Workshop - legal and privacy issues and technical issues associated with biometrics in immigration. These two themes were explored in detail, leading to a consensus to progress issues of mutual benefit in bilateral and multilateral data sharing arrangements.

2. Both groups identified a common interest in protecting personal information to foster greater public awareness of the benefits of using biometrics in immigration, including enhanced border security, disrupting criminal or terrorist activities and facilitating bona fide travel. The groups made a number of recommendations which have been included below.

3. Members agreed:
 - to increase cooperation among the Bali Process countries to optimise the use of biometrics to strengthen authorised migration, and prevent or disrupt unauthorised or irregular migration; and
 - to consider developing a framework of voluntary minimum standards to facilitate sharing biometrics to strengthen immigration integrity within the legal framework of member countries
 - to review these arrangements within 12 months in an appropriate Bali Process forum.
 - to provide members that are in the early stages of biometric development with expert advice to facilitate a smoother and faster implementation of biometric capabilities; and
 - to identify opportunities to negotiate bilateral or multilateral arrangements for the mutual benefit of members.



Bali Process Ad Hoc Group
Workshop on Biometrics for Identity Integrity in Immigration
India 23-26 April 2012

Conclusions

The Co-Chairs acknowledged the support of IOM in assisting all invited members to participate in the AHG Workshop on Biometrics for Identity Integrity in Immigration.

The Co-Chairs and members expressed their appreciation to the Government of India for its generosity and hospitality in hosting the AHG Workshop on Biometrics for Identity Integrity in Immigration.

Australia and India (Co-Chairs)
Bali Process Ad Hoc Group
Technical Experts Working Group on Irregular Movement
New Delhi, 26 April 2012